## FINAL EVALUATION REPORT (As Per Rule 35 of PP Rules, 2004)

1 4					
2	Name of Procuring Age	ncy Law and Justice C			
3	I WELLING OF FLOORINGS	ncy Law and Justice Commission of Pakistan Quality and Cost Based			
1	Title of Procurement	Procurement of Cost Based			
	1	Procurement of Consultancy Services for Strengthening and Expansion			
-		Strengthening and Expansion of National Judicial Automation Unit (NJAU)			
4	Tender Inquiry No.				
L	EOI (1st Time)	No.NJAU-01/PSDP-709/2021			
5	PPRA Ref. No. (TSE)				
	EOI (1st Time)	TS460375E			
6	Date & Time of Submission	uploaded on PPRA website on 22-09-2021  gih October, 2021, 1200 hours local time.			
	EOIs (1st Time)				
7 Date & Time of Opening of		law nours local time.			
	EOIs (1st Time)	9th October, 2021, 1230 hours local time.			
8	No. of EOIs Received	2021, 1230 hours local time.			
	. To Cols Received	Two (02):			
- 1		1) M/s Furaceneutica			
1		M/s Euroconsult Pakistan (Private) Limited in Joint Venture with Acrologiy (Private)			
9	Ougle	Joint Venture with Acrologix (Private) Limited in 2) M/s EGS (Private) Limited			
"	Qualification Criteria	2) M/s EGS (Private) Limited			
1		as mentioned in the roll			
		Criteria and Para-6: Minimum score required for			
10	Details of Evaluation	qualification) acute required for			
	PDPA F	Both firms got disqualis at the			
	PPRA Evaluation Ref. No.	Both firms got disqualified being non-responsive EV36647, uploaded on 25-10-2021			
2	Tender Inquiry No.	011 20-10-2021			
E	OI (2 <sup>nd</sup> Time)	No.NJAU-02/PSDP-709/2021			
3 F	PRA Ref. No. (TSE)	··············			
	OI (2 <sup>nd</sup> Time)	TS464486E			
4 10	Date & Time of Submission of	uploaded on PPRA website			
E	Ole (2nd Ti	of 29th November 2021 12021			
	Ols (2 <sup>no</sup> Time)	uploaded on PPRA website on 12-11-2021 of 29th November, 2021, 1200 hours local time.			
5 6	ale & Time of Opening of	1, 2021, 1200 hours local time.			
DE	Ols (2 <sup>nd</sup> Time) ate & Time of Opening of Ols (2 <sup>nd</sup> Time)	29th November, 2021, 1200 hours local time.			
DE	ale & Time of Opening of	29th November, 2021, 1230 hours local time.			
DE	Ols (2 <sup>nd</sup> Time) ate & Time of Opening of Ols (2 <sup>nd</sup> Time)	29th November, 2021, 1230 hours local time.  Four (04):			
DE	Ols (2 <sup>nd</sup> Time) ate & Time of Opening of Ols (2 <sup>nd</sup> Time)	29th November, 2021, 1230 hours local time.  Four (04):  1) M/s National Engineering Services Device.			
DE	Ols (2 <sup>nd</sup> Time) ate & Time of Opening of Ols (2 <sup>nd</sup> Time)	29th November, 2021, 1230 hours local time.  Four (04):  1) M/s National Engineering Services Pakistan (Private) Limited (NESPAK)			
DE	Ols (2 <sup>nd</sup> Time) ate & Time of Opening of Ols (2 <sup>nd</sup> Time)	29th November, 2021, 1230 hours local time.  29th November, 2021, 1230 hours local time.  Four (04):  1) M/s National Engineering Services Pakistan (Private) Limited (NESPAK)  2) M/s Carbon8 (Private) Limited			
DE	Ols (2 <sup>nd</sup> Time) ate & Time of Opening of Ols (2 <sup>nd</sup> Time)	29th November, 2021, 1230 hours local time.  Four (04):  1) M/s National Engineering Services Pakistan (Private) Limited (NESPAK)  2) M/s Carbon8 (Private) Limited  3) M/s Evamp & Saanga, Pakietan			
D E Z	ate & Time) ate & Time of Opening of Ols (2 <sup>nd</sup> Time) o. of EOIs Received	29th November, 2021, 1230 hours local time.  Four (04):  1) M/s National Engineering Services Pakistan (Private) Limited (NESPAK)  2) M/s Carbon8 (Private) Limited  3) M/s Evamp & Saanga, Pakistan  4) M/s Consulting Services international (CS)			
D E Z	Ols (2 <sup>nd</sup> Time) ate & Time of Opening of Ols (2 <sup>nd</sup> Time)	29th November, 2021, 1230 hours local time.  Four (04):  1) M/s National Engineering Services Pakistan (Private) Limited (NESPAK)  2) M/s Carbon8 (Private) Limited  3) M/s Evamp & Saanga, Pakistan  4) M/s Consulting Services International (CSi)  As mentioned in the EOI document (Page 5)			
D E Z	ate & Time) ate & Time of Opening of Ols (2 <sup>nd</sup> Time) o. of EOIs Received	29th November, 2021, 1230 hours local time.  Four (04):  1) M/s National Engineering Services Pakistan (Private) Limited (NESPAK)  2) M/s Carbon8 (Private) Limited  3) M/s Evamp & Saanga, Pakistan  4) M/s Consulting Services international (CSi)  As mentioned in the EOI document (Para-5: Eligibility Criteria and Para-6: Minimum score required for			
D E Z	ate & Time) ate & Time of Opening of Ols (2 <sup>nd</sup> Time) o. of EOIs Received	29th November, 2021, 1230 hours local time.  Four (04):  1) M/s National Engineering Services Pakistan (Private) Limited (NESPAK)  2) M/s Carbon8 (Private) Limited  3) M/s Evamp & Saanga, Pakistan  4) M/s Consulting Services international (CS)			
Q E Z	ate & Time of Opening of Ols (2 <sup>nd</sup> Time)  o. of EOIs Received	29th November, 2021, 1230 hours local time.  Four (04):  1) M/s National Engineering Services Pakistan (Private) Limited (NESPAK)  2) M/s Carbon8 (Private) Limited  3) M/s Evamp & Saanga, Pakistan  4) M/s Consulting Services international (CSi)  As mentioned in the EOI document (Para-5: Eligibility Criteria and Para-6: Minimum score required for qualification).			
Qu De	ate & Time of Opening of Ols (2 <sup>nd</sup> Time) o. of EOIs Received  ualification Criteria	29th November, 2021, 1230 hours local time.  Four (04):  1) M/s National Engineering Services Pakistan (Private) Limited (NESPAK)  2) M/s Carbon8 (Private) Limited  3) M/s Evamp & Saanga, Pakistan  4) M/s Consulting Services international (CSi)  As mentioned in the EOI document (Para-5: Eligibility Criteria and Para-6: Minimum score required for qualification).  Two (02):			
Qu De No	ate & Time of Opening of Ols (2 <sup>nd</sup> Time) o. of EOIs Received  tails of Evaluation: of EOIs shortlisted and	29th November, 2021, 1230 hours local time.  Four (04):  1) M/s National Engineering Services Pakistan (Private) Limited (NESPAK)  2) M/s Carbon8 (Private) Limited  3) M/s Evamp & Saanga, Pakistan  4) M/s Consulting Services International (CSi)  As mentioned in the EOI document (Para-5: Eligibility Criteria and Para-6: Minimum score required for qualification).  Two (02):  1) M/s National Engineering Services Pakistan			
Qu De No	ate & Time of Opening of Ols (2 <sup>nd</sup> Time) o. of EOIs Received  ualification Criteria	29th November, 2021, 1230 hours local time.  Four (04):  1) M/s National Engineering Services Pakistan (Private) Limited (NESPAK)  2) M/s Carbon8 (Private) Limited  3) M/s Evamp & Saanga, Pakistan  4) M/s Consulting Services International (CSi)  As mentioned in the EOI document (Para-5: Eligibility Criteria and Para-6: Minimum score required for qualification).  Two (02):  1) M/s National Engineering Services Pakistan (Private) Limited (NESPAK)			
Qu De No Iss	ate & Time of Opening of Ols (2 <sup>nd</sup> Time) o. of EOIs Received  tails of Evaluation: of EOIs shortlisted and ued RFP.	29th November, 2021, 1230 hours local time.  Four (04):  1) M/s National Engineering Services Pakistan (Private) Limited (NESPAK)  2) M/s Carbon8 (Private) Limited  3) M/s Evamp & Saanga, Pakistan  4) M/s Consulting Services International (CSi)  As mentioned in the EOI document (Para-5: Eligibility Criteria and Para-6: Minimum score required for qualification).  Two (02):  1) M/s National Engineering Services Pakistan (Private) Limited (NESPAK)  2) M/s Carbon8 (Private) Limited			
Qu De No Iss	ate & Time of Opening of Ols (2 <sup>nd</sup> Time) o. of EOIs Received  tails of Evaluation: of EOIs shortlisted and	29th November, 2021, 1230 hours local time.  Four (04):  1) M/s National Engineering Services Pakistan (Private) Limited (NESPAK)  2) M/s Carbon8 (Private) Limited  3) M/s Evamp & Saanga, Pakistan  4) M/s Consulting Services International (CSi)  As mentioned in the EOI document (Para-5: Eligibility Criteria and Para-6: Minimum score required for qualification).  Two (02):  1) M/s National Engineering Services Pakistan (Private) Limited (NESPAK)			
Qu De No Iss	ate & Time of Opening of Ols (2 <sup>nd</sup> Time) o. of EOIs Received  tails of Evaluation: of EOIs shortlisted and ued RFP.  RA Evaluation Ref. No.	29th November, 2021, 1230 hours local time.  Four (04):  1) M/s National Engineering Services Pakistan (Private) Limited (NESPAK)  2) M/s Carbon8 (Private) Limited  3) M/s Evamp & Saanga, Pakistan  4) M/s Consulting Services International (CSi)  As mentioned in the EOI document (Para-5: Eligibility Criteria and Para-6: Minimum score required for qualification).  Two (02):  1) M/s National Engineering Services Pakistan (Private) Limited (NESPAK)  2) M/s Carbon8 (Private) Limited  EV37421, uploaded on 10-12-2021			
Qu De No Issi	ate & Time of Opening of Ols (2 <sup>nd</sup> Time) o. of EOIs Received  tails of Evaluation: of EOIs shortlisted and ued RFP.  RA Evaluation Ref. No. P Tender Inquiry No.	29th November, 2021, 1230 hours local time.  Four (04):  1) M/s National Engineering Services Pakistan (Private) Limited (NESPAK)  2) M/s Carbon8 (Private) Limited  3) M/s Evamp & Saanga, Pakistan  4) M/s Consulting Services international (CSi)  As mentioned in the EOI document (Para-5: Eligibility Criteria and Para-6: Minimum score required for qualification).  Two (02):  1) M/s National Engineering Services Pakistan (Private) Limited (NESPAK)  2) M/s Carbon8 (Private) Limited  EV37421, uploaded on 10-12-2021  No.NJAU-03/PSDP-709/2021			
Qu De No Issi	ate & Time of Opening of Ols (2 <sup>nd</sup> Time) o. of EOIs Received  tails of Evaluation: of EOIs shortlisted and ued RFP.  RA Evaluation Ref. No.	29th November, 2021, 1230 hours local time.  Four (04):  1) M/s National Engineering Services Pakistan (Private) Limited (NESPAK)  2) M/s Carbon8 (Private) Limited  3) M/s Evamp & Saanga, Pakistan  4) M/s Consulting Services International (CSi)  As mentioned in the EOI document (Para-5: Eligibility Criteria and Para-6: Minimum score required for qualification).  Two (02):  1) M/s National Engineering Services Pakistan (Private) Limited (NESPAK)  2) M/s Carbon8 (Private) Limited  EV37421, uploaded on 10-12-2021  No.NJAU-03/PSDP-709/2021  TS471739E  uploaded on PPRA website on 03-02-2022			
Qu De No Issi	ate & Time of Opening of Ols (2nd Time) o. of EOIs Received  tails of Evaluation: of EOIs shortlisted and ued RFP.  RA Evaluation Ref. No. P Tender Inquiry No. P PPRA Ref. No. (TSE)	29th November, 2021, 1230 hours local time.  Four (04):  1) M/s National Engineering Services Pakistan (Private) Limited (NESPAK)  2) M/s Carbon8 (Private) Limited  3) M/s Evamp & Saanga, Pakistan  4) M/s Consulting Services international (CSi)  As mentioned in the EOI document (Para-5: Eligibility Criteria and Para-6: Minimum score required for qualification).  Two (02):  1) M/s National Engineering Services Pakistan (Private) Limited (NESPAK)  2) M/s Carbon8 (Private) Limited  EV37421, uploaded on 10-12-2021  No.NJAU-03/PSDP-709/2021  TS471739E uploaded on PPRA website on 03-02-2022			
Qu De No Issi	ate & Time of Opening of Ols (2 <sup>nd</sup> Time) o. of EOIs Received  tails of Evaluation: of EOIs shortlisted and ued RFP.  RA Evaluation Ref. No. P Tender Inquiry No.	29th November, 2021, 1230 hours local time.  Four (04):  1) M/s National Engineering Services Pakistan (Private) Limited (NESPAK)  2) M/s Carbon8 (Private) Limited  3) M/s Evamp & Saanga, Pakistan  4) M/s Consulting Services international (CSi)  As mentioned in the EOI document (Para-5: Eligibility Criteria and Para-6: Minimum score required for qualification).  Two (02):  1) M/s National Engineering Services Pakistan (Private) Limited (NESPAK)  2) M/s Carbon8 (Private) Limited  EV37421, uploaded on 10-12-2021  No.NJAU-03/PSDP-709/2021  TS471739E uploaded on PPRA website on 03-02-2022			
Qu De No Issu PPI RFI Dat	ate & Time of Opening of Ols (2nd Time) o. of EOIs Received  tails of Evaluation: of EOIs shortlisted and ued RFP.  RA Evaluation Ref. No. P Tender Inquiry No. P PPRA Ref. No. (TSE) te & Time of Bid Closing	29th November, 2021, 1230 hours local time.  Four (04):  1) M/s National Engineering Services Pakistan (Private) Limited (NESPAK)  2) M/s Carbon8 (Private) Limited  3) M/s Evamp & Saanga, Pakistan  4) M/s Consulting Services international (CSi)  As mentioned in the EOI document (Para-5: Eligibility Criteria and Para-6: Minimum score required for qualification).  Two (02):  1) M/s National Engineering Services Pakistan (Private) Limited (NESPAK)  2) M/s Carbon8 (Private) Limited  EV37421, uploaded on 10-12-2021  No.NJAU-03/PSDP-709/2021  TS471739E uploaded on PPRA website on 03-02-2022			
Qu De No Issu PPI RFI Dat	ate & Time of Opening of Ols (2nd Time) o. of EOIs Received  tails of Evaluation: of EOIs shortlisted and ued RFP.  RA Evaluation Ref. No. P Tender Inquiry No. P PPRA Ref. No. (TSE)	29th November, 2021, 1230 hours local time.  Four (04):  1) M/s National Engineering Services Pakistan (Private) Limited (NESPAK)  2) M/s Carbon8 (Private) Limited  3) M/s Evamp & Saanga, Pakistan  4) M/s Consulting Services international (CSi)  As mentioned in the EOI document (Para-5: Eligibility Criteria and Para-6: Minimum score required for qualification).  Two (02):  1) M/s National Engineering Services Pakistan (Private) Limited (NESPAK)  2) M/s Carbon8 (Private) Limited  EV37421, uploaded on 10-12-2021  No.NJAU-03/PSDP-709/2021  TS471739E uploaded on PPRA website on 03-02-2022			
Qu De No Issu PPI RFI Dat	ate & Time of Opening of Ols (2nd Time) o. of EOIs Received  tails of Evaluation: of EOIs shortlisted and ued RFP.  RA Evaluation Ref. No. P Tender Inquiry No. P PPRA Ref. No. (TSE) te & Time of Bid Closing	29th November, 2021, 1230 hours local time.  Four (04):  1) M/s National Engineering Services Pakistan (Private) Limited (NESPAK)  2) M/s Carbon8 (Private) Limited  3) M/s Evamp & Saanga, Pakistan  4) M/s Consulting Services international (CSi)  As mentioned in the EOI document (Para-5: Eligibility Criteria and Para-6: Minimum score required for qualification).  Two (02):  1) M/s National Engineering Services Pakistan (Private) Limited (NESPAK)  2) M/s Carbon8 (Private) Limited  EV37421, uploaded on 10-12-2021  No.NJAU-03/PSDP-709/2021  TS471739E uploaded on PPRA website on 03-02-2022			

23	Date & Time of Bid Opening (RFP)	Opened Technical Proposals on: 18th February, 2022, 1230 hours local time. Opened Financial Proposals on: 18th March, 2022, 0930 hours local time.				
24	No. of Technical Proposals Qualified	Two (02):	Score obtained out of 70			
		M/s National     Engineering Services     Pakistan (Private)     Limited (NESPAK)	58			
		M/s Carbon8 (Private)     Limited	60			
25	Qualification Criteria	As mentioned in the RFP document (I.B.9 & Section-3, Evaluation Criteria). Qualifying score is 70% (i.e. 49 out of 70).				
26	PPRA Evaluation Ref. No. (Technical Evaluation Report)	EV39443, uploaded on 09-03-2022				

ZI. Details of C	ombined Ev			& Financia	il Proposals);
	77/88	M	arks		THE PARTY OF THE P

	Marks			1	
Name of Bidder	Technical Financial		Total Marks	Evaluated Gost	Rule/Regulation/ SBD*/Policy/ Basis for Rejection / Acceptance as per Rule 35 of PP Rules, 2004.
M/s Carbon8 (Private) Limited	60 x 0.7 = 42	100 x 0.3 = 30	42+30 = 72	Rs. 17,500,000/-	1st
M/s National Engineering Services Pakistan (Private) Limited (Nespak).	58 × 0.7 = 40.60	87.56 x 0.3 = 26.27	40.60+26.27 = 66.87	Rs.19,987,012/	2nd

\*Standard Bidding Documents (SBD)

28. Top Ranked Bidder / Firm:

M/s Carbon8 Private Limited has achieved the highest score of 72 on the basis of Combined Evaluation (Technical & Financial Proposals) and is recommended for award of contract @ Rs.17,500,000/-.

(Tariq Aziz)

Computer Programmer

Federal Judicial Academy

(Member)

Procurement Expert

Ministry of Law and Justice

(Member)

(Rizwan Ahmed)

Manager Infrastructure

Ministry of IT and Telecommunication

(Member)

(Javyad Khan)

Joint Secretary (NJPMC)

Law and Justice Commission of Pakistan

(Member)

(Abdul Rasheed Mahar) Project Director (NJAU)

(Chairman)