NATIONAL HIGHWAY AUTHORITY

Procurement & Contract Administration Section
28-Mauve Area, G-9/1, Islamabad Tel: 9032727, Fax: 9260419

No. 6(570)/GM/(P&CA)/NHA/2023/ 131 Islamabad, 12.April,2023

Director General
Public Procurement Regulatory Authority
1st Floor FBC Building near State Bank,
Sector G-5/2, **Islamabad**

Subject: **ANNOUNCEMENT OF FINAL EVALUATION REPORT (PPRA RULE-35):**
CONSULTANCY SERVICES FOR FEASIBILITY STUDY & DETAILED DESIGN FOR CONSTRUCTION OF KHWAZAKHELA-BESHAM EXPRESSWAY (64 KM)

Reference: PPRA Rule-35

Find enclosed herewith the Final Evaluation Report along with Evaluation Criteria (Annex-I) for the subject Services in line with PPRA Rule-35 for uploading on PPRA website at the earliest, please.

(SAMI-UR-RAHMAN)
General Manager (P&CA)

Distribution:

Encl: Evaluation Report along with **Annex- I**

Copy to:

- Member (Planning), NHA, Islamabad;
- Director (Tech. to Chairman), NHA, Islamabad;
- Dy. Director (P&CA), NHA, Islamabad.

FINAL EVALUATION REPORT

(As Per Rule 35 of PP Rules, 2004)

1.	Name of Procuring Agency:	National Highway Authority
2.	Method of Procurement:	Single Stage Two Envelope Procedure
3.	Title of Procurement:	Consultancy Services For Feasibility Study & Detailed Design For Construction Of Khwazakhela-Besham Expressway (64 Km)
4.	Tender Inquiry No.:	6(570)
5.	PPRA Ref. No. (TSE):	TS485240E
6.	Date & Time of Bid Closing:	25th August, 2022 at 1130 hours local time
7.	Date & Time of Bid Opening:	25th August, 2022 at 1200 hours local time
8.	No of Bids Received:	Eight (08) Proposals were received
9.	Criteria for Bid Evaluation:	Criteria of Bid Evaluation is attached at Annex-I
10.	Details of Bid(s) Evaluation:	As below

Name of Bidder	Marks			Evaluated Cost (EC)* (PKR)	Rule/Regulation/ SBD**/Policy/ Basis for Rejection / Acceptance as per Rule 35 of PP Rules, 2004.
	Technical Score (St) (80%)	Financial Score (Sf) (20 %)	Total Score (100%)		
1)M/s Prime Engineering & Testing in JV with M/s. Engineering & Management Services, M/s. BK Consultant & In Association with M/s. NIES	626	199	825	26,669,917	Top scoring firm in combined evaluation (PPRA Rule 36(b)(ix))
2) M/s Asif Ali & Associates (Pvt.) Ltd. in association with M/s Pakistan Engineering Tech (PET) (Sub-Consultant)	612	200	812	26,514,854	2nd
3) M/s Finite Engineering (Pvt.) Ltd., in association with M/s Design Expert Consultant (sub-consultant) (PET) (Sub-Consultant)	620	177	797	30,036,187	3rd

FINAL EVALUATION REPORT

(As Per Rule 35 of PP Rules, 2004)

Name of Bidder	Marks			Evaluated Cost (EC)* (PKR)	Rule/Regulation/ SBD**/Policy/ Basis for Rejection / Acceptance as per Rule 35 of PP Rules, 2004.
	Technical Score (St) (80%)	Financial Score (Sf) (20 %)	Total Score (100%)		
4) M/s Associated Consultancy Centre (Pvt.) Ltd. in JV with M/s Associated Consulting Engineers-ACE Ltds., in M/s Zeeruk International (Pvt.) Ltd. and in association with M/s Creative Structural Engineering Solutions (CSES)-Sub-consultant	607	173	780	30,567,466	4th
5) M/s NESPAK (Pvt.) Ltd. in JV with M/s Engineering General Consultants-EGC (Pvt.) Ltd., and in association with M/s HARZA Consultants (SMC-Pvt.) Ltd. (Sub-Consultant) (CSES)-Sub-consultant	621	119	740	44,590,583	5th
6) M/s AA Associates in JV with M/s Global Engineering System (NIES) (Sub Consultant	550	Technically Dis-Qualified			(Less than 70%.) PPRA Rule 36(b)(v)
7) M/s Umar Munshi Associates in JV with M/s Concept Planning and Engineering Services.	529	Technically Dis-Qualified			(Less than 70%.) PPRA Rule 36(b)(v)
8) M/s Allied Engineering Services (Pvt.) Ltd. (NIES) (Sub Consultant)	430	Technically Dis-Qualified			(Less than 70%.) PPRA Rule 36(b)(v)

**EC is the Evaluated Cost used for evaluation purpose and includes only the cost of competitive component (i.e. Remuneration and Direct Non-Salary Cost) and is exclusive of Provisional Sum, Contingency and Indirect Taxes.*

FINAL EVALUATION REPORT

(As Per Rule 35 of PP Rules, 2004)

Top Ranked Bidder: **M/s Prime Engineering & Testing in JV with M/s. Engineering & Management Services, M/s. BK Consultant & In Association with M/s. NIES**

11. **Any other additional/supporting information, the procuring agency may like to share:** The Procurement was carried out in line with PPRA Rules & Regulations. The bidding was done on QCBS method with 80:20 Technical to Financial Proposals ratio. The Contract will be awarded to M/s Prime Engineering & Testing in JV with M/s. Engineering & Management Services, M/s. BK Consultant & In Association with M/s. NIES at rebated Consultancy Cost of Pak. Rs. 25,686,684/- which includes Remuneration, Reimbursable Expenses and all applicable Federal, Provincial and Local taxes including GST.

Signature:.....

Official Stamp:.....

National Highway Authority P&CA Govt. of Pakistan

***Standard Bidding Documents (SBD).**

National Highway Authority

Annex-I

Criteria

FOR

Final Evaluation

CONSULTANCY SERVICES FOR FEASIBILITY STUDY & DETAILED DESIGN FOR CONSTRUCTION OF KHWAZAKHELA-BESHAM EXPRESSWAY (64 KM)

April, 2023

SUMMARY EVALUATION SHEET FOR FULL TECHNICAL PROPOSALS (QCBS)

EVALUATION CRITERIA	Max. Weightage	Firm 1		Firm 2	
		Rating	Score	Rating	Score
1. Firms Experience	**100**				
General Experience in road Transport Sector	25				
Specific Experience related to particular Assignment	75				
2. Approach and Methodology	**250**				
2-a. *Appreciation of the Project*	70				
(i) Evidence of Site Visit with Photographs	(30)				
(ii) Clarity of appreciation	(20)				
(iii) Comprehensiveness of appreciation	(20)				
2-b. Problem Statement/ understanding of objectives	50				
(i) Identification of Problems/ Objectives	(30)				
(ii) Components of Proposed Services	(20)				
2-c. Methodology	80				
(i) Proposed Solutions for this Project	(30)				
(ii) Quality of Methodology	(20)				
(iii) Conciseness, clarity and completeness of proposal	(30)				
2-d. Suggested Changes for Improvement in TOR	10				
2-e. Work Program	20				
2-f. Staffing Schedule	20				
3. Key Personnel	**450**				
Firm affidavit for presence of personnel	**25**				
i. Team Leader/Senior Highway Engineer	130				
ii. Structural Engineer	100				
iii. Pavement Engineer	100				
iv. Transport Economist	55				
v. Quantity Surveyor	40				
4. Performance Certification from clients	**75**				
Affidavit on stamp paper duly attested by the Oath Commissioner regarding non-blacklisting	**25**				
5. Present Commitments (current engagement and available strength – justification)	**50**				
6. Transfer of Knowledge (Methodology/ Plans)	**50**				
TOTAL:	**1000**				

Excellent - 100% Very Good - 90-99% Above Average – 80-89% Average – 70-79% Below Average – 1-69% Non-complying – 0%,

Score: Maximum Weightage rating / 100. Minimum qualifying score is 70% or 700 marks.

National Highway Authority ★ P&C ★ Govt. of Pakistan

PERSONNEL EVALUATION SHEET

POSITION / AREA OF EXPERTISE	Name	Academic and General Qualification Weightage 30%		Project related Experience Weightage 60%		Status with the Firm 10%		OVERALL RATING (Sum of Weighted Ratings)
(Show all experts to be evaluated)		Percentage Rating	Weighted Rating (A)	Percentage Rating	Weighted Rating (B)	Percentage Rating	Weighted Rating (C)	(A+B+C)
i. Team Leader/Senior Highway Engineer								
ii. Structural Engineer								
iii. Pavement Engineer								
iv. Transport Economist								
v. Quantity Surveyor								

Rating: - Excellent - 100% **Very good – 90-99%** **Above Average – 80-89%** **Average – 70-79%** **Below Average – 1-69%** **Non-complying 0%**

Score: Maximum Weightage X rating / 100. Minimum qualifying score is 70%.

National Highway Authority ★ P&CA ★ Govt of Pakistan