



PAKISTAN WATER & POWER DEVELOPMENT AUTHORITY

Telephone: (042) 99202717
Fax: (042) 99202722
Email: gmhydroplanning@gmail.com

General Manager (Hydro) Planning
WAPDA, Sunny View Estate,
Kashmir Road, Lahore

No. CF-II (H) P HDN-1009-A / 1256

Date. 22-03-2022

Director Public Relations (PRD)
WAPDA, G-32 Wapda House
Lahore


Subject: **HINGOL DAM PROJECT (NEW SITE) - PROCUREMENT OF
CONSULTANCY SERVICES FOR DETAILED ENGINEERING DESIGN
AND PREPARATION OF TENDER DOCUMENTS & PC-I**

ANNOUNCEMENT OF EVALUATION REPORT (PPRA RULE-35)

Subsequent upon approval of competent authority, kindly find attached duly filled and signed evaluation report along with Bid Evaluation Criteria (**Annexure-I**), pertaining to the procurement of subject Contract in view of PPRA Rule-35 for uploading on PPRA's website at the earliest, please.

It is further informed that the "Evaluation Report" in soft format has also been emailed to *wapdaprap1@gmail.com* on March 24, 2022.

DA/As above


(Muhammad Abid Sheikh)
General Manager (Hydro) Planning

Copy to:

1. General Manager (C&M), Water, WAPDA, Wapda House, Lahore
2. General Manager (CCC) WAPDA, Wapda House, Lahore
3. Chief Engineer-II (Hydro) Planning WAPDA, Sunny View Estate, Lahore.
4. SO to Member (Water) WAPDA, Wapda House, Lahore

Annexure-I

Final Evaluation Report (As Per Rule 35 of PP Rules, 2004)

1.	Name of Procuring Agency:	Pakistan Water And Power Development Authority (WAPDA)
2.	Method of Procurement:	Single Stage Two Envelope
3.	Title of Procurement:	Consultancy Services for Detailed Engineering Design and Preparation of Tender Documents & PC-I of Hingol Dam Project (New Site)
4.	Tender Inquiry No.:	PRD(L)/WAPDA/412(2020-21)
5.	PPRA Ref. No. (TSE):	TS450873E
6.	Date & Time of Bid Closing:	June 30, 2021 at 11:00 hrs
7.	Date & Time of Bid Opening:	June 30, 2021 at 11:30 hrs
8.	No of Bids Received:	Nine (09)
9.	Criteria for Bid Evaluation:	Criteria of Bid Evaluation, relevant pages attached as Annexure-II
10.	Details of Bid(s) Evaluation:	As Below

Name of Bidder	Marks		Evaluated Cost (EC)** (Rs.)	Rule/Regulation/SBD*/ Policy/ Basis for Rejection / Acceptance as per Rule 35 of PP Rules, 2004.
	Technical (if applicable) 80%	Financial (if applicable) 20%		
M/s BAK Consulting Engineers -JV	64.90	17.52	83,438,619	Highest/ Top Ranked Proposal (PP Rule 3(B) (ii) (c-iii) & 9(4) of 2010)
M/s Toosab Consulting Engineers Company (Iran) -JV	61.82	20.00	73,084,191	2 nd ranked
M/s National Engineering Services Pakistan, NESPAK (Pvt.) Ltd	66.76	14.62	99,989,705	3 rd ranked
M/s EGC (Pvt.) Ltd. -JV	60.30	15.53	94,089,895	4 th ranked
M/s Aqualogus, Engenharia e Ambiente Lda. -JV	66.18	8.46	172,746,000	5 th ranked
M/s Dar Al-Handasah Consultants (Lebanon) - JV	60.85	8.83	165,533,276	6 th ranked
M/s National Development Consultants NDC (Pvt.) Ltd - JV	36.15	-	-	PP Rule 9(3) of 2010 & PP Rule 36 (b) (v) of 2004
M/s Designmen Consulting Engineers (Pvt.) Ltd. - JV	20.13	-	-	
AAB (Pvt.) Ltd. - JV	12.81	-	-	

* SBD: Standard Bidding Documents

**EC is the Evaluated Cost used for evaluation purpose and includes only the cost of competitive component (i.e. Remuneration and Direct Non-Salary Cost) and is exclusive of Provisional Sum, Indirect

taxes and cost of WAPDA counterpart staff. Financial proposals of only technically qualified Firms/JVs were opened and evaluated by the committee, other proposals will be returned unopened.

Most Advantageous Bidder: M/s BAK Consulting Engineers with M/s AGES, M/s ELECTRA (JV) in association with M/s CivTech Associates

11. **Any other additional / supporting information, the procuring agency may like to share:** The Procurement was carried out in line with Public Procurement Rules & Regulations. The bidding was done on Quantity & Cost Based Selection (QCBS) Method. The Contract is being awarded to Top Ranked JV.

Signature:



Official Stamp:

General Manager
.....**Hydro Planning**
Wapda Sunny View, Lahore.

**PAKISTAN
WATER AND POWER DEVELOPMENT AUTHORITY**



HINGOL DAM PROJECT (NEW SITE)

REQUEST FOR PROPOSALS

FOR

**PROCUREMENT OF CONSULTANCY SERVICES FOR
DETAILED ENGINEERING DESIGN, PREPARATION OF
BIDDING DOCUMENTS AND PC-I**

GENERAL MANAGER (HYDRO) PLANNING

WAPDA, SUNNY VIEW ESTATE, LAHORE.

May 2021

Section 2. Instructions to Consultants and Data Sheet

Instructions to Consultants

E. Data Sheet

ITC Clause Reference	
C. Submission, Opening and Evaluation	
17.1	The Consultants shall not have the option of submitting their Proposals electronically.
17.4	The Consultant must submit: (a) Technical Proposal: one (1) original and five (05) copies; (b) Financial Proposal: one (1) original.
17.7 and 17.9	The Proposals must be submitted no later than: Date: <u>June 15, 2021</u> Time: 1100 hours <hr/> The Proposal submission address is: Office of General Manager (HRM), WAPDA 228-Wapda House, Lahore. Telephone: (+92-42) 99202631 Facsimile: (+92-42) 99202795 Email: gmpndwater@gmail.com

ITC Clause Reference																															
19.1	<p>An online option of the opening of the Technical Proposals is offered: No</p> <p>The opening of Technical Proposals shall take place at: Office of General Manager (HRM), WAPDA 228-Wapda House, Lahore. Telephone: (+92-42) 99202631 Facsimile: (+92-42) 99202795 Email: Email: gmpndwater@gmail.com</p> <p>Date: same as the submission deadline indicated in 17.7. Time: 1130 hours</p>																														
19.2	<p>In addition, the following information will be read aloud at the opening of the Technical Proposals.</p> <p>N/A</p>																														
21.1 (for FTP)	<p>Criteria, sub-criteria, and point system for the evaluation of the Full Technical Proposals:</p> <table border="0"> <tr> <td></td> <td style="text-align: right;">Points</td> </tr> <tr> <td>(i) Specific experience of the Consultant (as a firm) relevant to the Assignment:</td> <td style="text-align: right;">[30]</td> </tr> <tr> <td colspan="2">Detailed Engineering Design and Preparation of Bidding Documents of Hydropower/Dam Projects.</td> </tr> <tr> <td> a) Detailed Engineering Design of Dam Projects</td> <td style="text-align: right;">24</td> </tr> <tr> <td> b) Preparation of Bidding Documents</td> <td style="text-align: right;">06</td> </tr> <tr> <td colspan="2">Specific / similar projects completed in the last 10 years.</td> </tr> <tr> <td colspan="2"> <table border="1" style="margin-left: auto; margin-right: auto;"> <tr> <th>No. of Project(s)</th><th>% age Marks</th></tr> <tr> <td style="text-align: center;">1</td><td style="text-align: center;">60</td></tr> <tr> <td style="text-align: center;">2</td><td style="text-align: center;">100</td></tr> </table> </td></tr> <tr> <td>(ii) Adequacy and quality of the proposed methodology, and work plan in responding to the Terms of Reference (TORs):</td><td style="text-align: right;">[15]</td></tr> <tr> <td> a) Technical approach and methodology</td><td style="text-align: right;">10</td></tr> <tr> <td> b) Work Plan</td><td style="text-align: right;">3</td></tr> <tr> <td> c) Organization and staffing</td><td style="text-align: right;">2</td></tr> <tr> <td colspan="2"><i>{Notes to Consultant: the Client will assess whether the proposed</i></td></tr> </table>		Points	(i) Specific experience of the Consultant (as a firm) relevant to the Assignment:	[30]	Detailed Engineering Design and Preparation of Bidding Documents of Hydropower/Dam Projects.		a) Detailed Engineering Design of Dam Projects	24	b) Preparation of Bidding Documents	06	Specific / similar projects completed in the last 10 years.		<table border="1" style="margin-left: auto; margin-right: auto;"> <tr> <th>No. of Project(s)</th><th>% age Marks</th></tr> <tr> <td style="text-align: center;">1</td><td style="text-align: center;">60</td></tr> <tr> <td style="text-align: center;">2</td><td style="text-align: center;">100</td></tr> </table>		No. of Project(s)	% age Marks	1	60	2	100	(ii) Adequacy and quality of the proposed methodology, and work plan in responding to the Terms of Reference (TORs):	[15]	a) Technical approach and methodology	10	b) Work Plan	3	c) Organization and staffing	2	<i>{Notes to Consultant: the Client will assess whether the proposed</i>	
	Points																														
(i) Specific experience of the Consultant (as a firm) relevant to the Assignment:	[30]																														
Detailed Engineering Design and Preparation of Bidding Documents of Hydropower/Dam Projects.																															
a) Detailed Engineering Design of Dam Projects	24																														
b) Preparation of Bidding Documents	06																														
Specific / similar projects completed in the last 10 years.																															
<table border="1" style="margin-left: auto; margin-right: auto;"> <tr> <th>No. of Project(s)</th><th>% age Marks</th></tr> <tr> <td style="text-align: center;">1</td><td style="text-align: center;">60</td></tr> <tr> <td style="text-align: center;">2</td><td style="text-align: center;">100</td></tr> </table>		No. of Project(s)	% age Marks	1	60	2	100																								
No. of Project(s)	% age Marks																														
1	60																														
2	100																														
(ii) Adequacy and quality of the proposed methodology, and work plan in responding to the Terms of Reference (TORs):	[15]																														
a) Technical approach and methodology	10																														
b) Work Plan	3																														
c) Organization and staffing	2																														
<i>{Notes to Consultant: the Client will assess whether the proposed</i>																															

ITC Clause Reference																															
	<p><i>methodology is clear, responds to the TORs, work plan is realistic and implementable; overall team composition is balanced and has an appropriate skills mix; and the work plan has right input of Experts}</i></p> <p>(iii) Key Experts’ qualifications and competence for the Assignment: {<i>Notes to Consultant: each position number corresponds to the same for the Key Experts in Form TECH-6 to be prepared by the Consultant</i>}</p> <table><tr><th>Sr. #</th><th>Key Experts</th><th>Weightage</th></tr><tr><td>1</td><td>Project Manager / Team Leader</td><td>13</td></tr><tr><td>2</td><td>Expert (Geotechnical)</td><td>8</td></tr><tr><td>3</td><td>Expert (Hydraulic Design)</td><td>8</td></tr><tr><td>4</td><td>Expert (Structure Design)</td><td>6</td></tr><tr><td>5</td><td>Expert (Geology)</td><td>6</td></tr><tr><td>6</td><td>Expert (Irrigation Design)</td><td>5</td></tr><tr><td>7</td><td>Expert (Hydrology & Sedimentation)</td><td>5</td></tr><tr><td>8</td><td>Expert (Environment)</td><td>4</td></tr><tr><td></td><td>Total:</td><td>55</td></tr></table> <p>Total points for criterion (iii): [55] <i>Required qualification and experience of Key Experts are provided in Term of Reference (TOR).</i></p> <p>The number of points to be assigned to each of the above positions shall be determined considering the following three sub-criteria and relevant percentage weights:</p> <div><div>1) General qualifications (Masters and PhD): [20%]</div><div><i>Basic requirements of education:</i> 15%</div><div><i>Higher than required education:</i> 5%</div><div>2) Adequacy for the Assignment (General Experience, Experience in sector / similar assignments / position): [75%]</div><div><i>Overall General experience:</i> 15%</div><div><i>Specific experience:</i> 40%</div><div><i>Specific experience of working in specific position:</i> 20%</div><div>3) Status with the firm: [05%]</div><div><i>Full points for permanent otherwise NO points.</i> 5%</div><div>Total weight: [100%]</div><div>Total points for the three criteria: 100</div></div>	Sr. #	Key Experts	Weightage	1	Project Manager / Team Leader	13	2	Expert (Geotechnical)	8	3	Expert (Hydraulic Design)	8	4	Expert (Structure Design)	6	5	Expert (Geology)	6	6	Expert (Irrigation Design)	5	7	Expert (Hydrology & Sedimentation)	5	8	Expert (Environment)	4		Total:	55
Sr. #	Key Experts	Weightage																													
1	Project Manager / Team Leader	13																													
2	Expert (Geotechnical)	8																													
3	Expert (Hydraulic Design)	8																													
4	Expert (Structure Design)	6																													
5	Expert (Geology)	6																													
6	Expert (Irrigation Design)	5																													
7	Expert (Hydrology & Sedimentation)	5																													
8	Expert (Environment)	4																													
	Total:	55																													

ITC Clause Reference	
	<p>.....</p> <p>The minimum technical score (St) required to pass is: 75</p> <p>Notes:</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. All the experts of the level of Principal / Chief and above should be nominated by name in the proposal. 2. Age limit of Consultant Staff required to work in the field should be restricted to 70 (seventy) years of age. However, for those staff who are nominated purely for office / desk job, the age limit should be restricted to 75 (seventy five) years. 3. For the purpose of evaluation of technical proposals, “Permanent Status” means that the staff employed by the firm continuously for the last two years. 4. Appointment letters or verifiable supporting documents of Key Experts need to be provided with technical proposals to confirm the status with respective firm. 5. The key experts of Consultants must be proficient in written and spoken English. 6. The experience of Key Expert will be evaluated on pro-rata basis in case period of experience is found shorter than required. 7. The Key Expert not having requisite basic education will not be considered for further evaluation.
23.1	<p>An online option of the opening of the Financial Proposals is offered:</p> <p>No</p>
25.1	<p>The word “taxes” in the 2nd line is deleted and replaced with “indirect taxes”.</p>
26.1	<p>The single currency for conversion of all prices expressed in various currencies into a single one is Rupees.</p> <p>The official source of selling (exchange) rate is National Bank of Pakistan.</p> <p>The date of exchange rate is 28 days prior to the proposal submission.</p>
27.1 (QCBS only)	<p>The lowest evaluated Financial Proposal (Fm) is given the maximum financial score (Sf) of 100.</p> <p>The formula for determining the financial scores (Sf) of all other Proposals is calculated as following:</p> <p>$Sf = 100 \times Fm / F$, in which “Sf” is the financial score, “Fm” is the lowest price, and “F” the price of the proposal under consideration.</p>

ITC Clause Reference	
	<p>The weights given to the Technical (T) and Financial (P) Proposals are: T = 80% and P = 20% Proposals are ranked according to their combined technical (St) and financial (Sf) scores using the weights (T = the weight given to the Technical Proposal; P = the weight given to the Financial Proposal; T + P = 1) as following: $S = S_t \times T\% + S_f \times P\%$.</p>
	D. Negotiations and Award
28.1	<p>Expected date and address for contract negotiations: Date: August 06, 2021 Address: Office of General Manager (Hydro Planning), WAPDA, Sunny View Estate, Kashmir Road, Lahore.</p>
30.1	<p>The publication of the contract award information following the completion of the contract negotiations and contract signing will be done as following: <u>www.wapda.gov.pk</u></p> <p>The publication will be done within fifteen (15) days after the contract signing.</p>
30.2	<p>Expected date for the commencement of the Services: Date: September 01, 2021 at: Lahore.</p>

6 Staff Inputs (Consultants)

6.1 Qualification Requirements for the Key Experts

Consultants will assign adequately qualified key personnel's to carry out the study as described in TOR. Key experts should possess the qualifications and experience as mentioned below:

- 6.1.1 Project Manager / Team Leader:** He / She should have at least be Master's Degree in Civil Engineering from a recognized university. Ph.D. qualification in Civil Engineering shall be given additional weightage.

The incumbent should have specific experience of working in senior techno-managerial position with at least 10 years as team leader on dams and hydropower projects. The incumbent should have minimum experience of 25 years with at least 15 years on similar assignments of dams and hydropower projects. The incumbent should be able to lead the team of Consultants and assist WAPDA in timely completion of the services with a quality output.

- 6.1.2 Expert (Geotechnical):** He / She should have at least Master's Degree in Civil/ Rock Mechanics / Geotechnical Engineering from a recognized university. Ph.D. qualification in Geotechnical Engineering will be given additional weightage.

The incumbent should have at least 20 years overall experience with minimum of 15 years in geotechnical design of similar projects. The incumbent should have at least 5 years of working experience as Expert (Geotechnical).

- 6.1.3 Expert (Hydraulic Design):** He / She should have at least Master's Degree in Hydraulic / Water Resource Engineering from a recognized university. Ph.D. qualification in related disciplines will be given additional weightage.

The incumbent should have at least 20 years overall experience with minimum of 15 years on the design of similar projects. The incumbent should have at least 5 years of working experience as Expert (Hydraulic Design).

- 6.1.4 Expert (Structure Design):** He / She should have at least Master's Degree in Structural Engineering discipline from a recognized university. Ph.D. qualification in Structural Engineering will be given additional weightage.

The incumbent should have at least 20 years overall experience with minimum of 15 years on the design of similar projects. The incumbent should have at least 5 years of working experience as Expert (Structure Design).

- 6.1.5 **Expert (Geology):** He / She should have at least Master's Degree in Geology from recognized university. Ph.D. qualification in Geology will be given additional weightage.

The incumbent should have at least 20 years overall experience with minimum of 15 years on the design of similar projects. The incumbent should have at least 5 years of working experience as Expert (Geology).

- 6.1.6 **Expert (Irrigation Design):** He / She should have at least Master's Degree in Civil / Irrigation / HEIS Engineering from a recognized university. Ph.D. qualification in Irrigation / HEIS Engineering will be given additional weightage.

The incumbent should have at least 20 years overall experience with minimum of 15 years on the similar assignments. The incumbent should have at least 5 years of working experience as Expert (Irrigation).

- 6.1.7 **Expert (Hydrology and Sedimentation):** He / She should have at least Master's Degree in Hydrology/ Water Resources Engineering from recognized university. Ph.D. qualification in Hydrology/ Water Resources Engineering will be given additional weightage.

The incumbent should have at least 20 years overall experience with minimum of 15 years on similar projects/ assignments. The incumbent should have at least 5 years of working experience as Expert (Hydrology & Sedimentation).

- 6.1.8 **Expert (Environment):** He / She should have Master's Degree in Environmental Engineering from a recognized university. Ph.D. qualification in related discipline will be given additional weightage.

The incumbent should have at least overall experience of 20 years with 15 years working on similar assignments & projects. The incumbent should have at least 5 years of working experience as Expert (Environment)