



NATIONAL HIGHWAY AUTHORITY

Procurement & Contract Administration Section

28-Mauve Area, G-9/1, Islamabad Tel: 9032727, Fax: 9260419

No. 6(536)/DIR-III(P&CA)/NHA/2023/65

Islamabad, 18th February, 2023

Director General

Public Procurement Regulatory Authority
1st Floor FBC Building near State Bank,
Sector G-5/2, **Islamabad**

Subject: **ANNOUNCEMENT OF FINAL EVALUATION REPORT (PPRA
RULE-35):
CONSULTANCY SERVICES FOR FEASIBILITY STUDY AND
DETAILED DESIGN FOR CONSTRUCTION OF KHARAN -
BASIMA ROAD (125 KM)**

Reference: *PPRA Rule-35*

Find enclosed herewith the Final Evaluation Report along with Evaluation Criteria (Annex-I) for the subject Services in line with PPRA Rule-35 for uploading on PPRA website at the earliest, please.

(MUHAMMAD AHMED ABRO)
DIRECTOR (CONSULTANCY) P&CA

Encl: Evaluation Report along with **Annex- I**

Copy for kind information to:

- Member (Planning), NHA Islamabad;
- Deputy Director (P&CA), NHA Islamabad.

FINAL EVALUATION REPORT

(As Per Rule 35 of PP Rules, 2004)

1.	Name of Procuring Agency:	National Highway Authority
2.	Method of Procurement:	Single Stage Two Envelope Procedure
3.	Title of Procurement:	Consultancy Services for Feasibility Study and Detailed Design for Construction of Kharan – Basima Road (125 KM)
4.	Tender Inquiry No.:	6(536)
5.	PPRA Ref. No. (TSE):	TS444749E
6.	Date & Time of Bid Closing:	26 th March, 2021 at 1130 hours local time
7.	Date & Time of Bid Opening:	26 th March, 2021 at 1200 hours local time
8.	No of Bids Received:	Four (04) Proposals were received
9.	Criteria for Bid Evaluation:	Criteria of Bid Evaluation is attached at Annex-I
10.	Details of Bid(s) Evaluation:	As below

Name of Bidder	Marks			Evaluated Cost (EC)* (PKR)	Rule/Regulation/ SBD**/Policy/ Basis for Rejection / Acceptance as per Rule 35 of PP Rules, 2004.
	Technical Score (St) (80%)	Financial Score (Sf) (20 %)	Total Score (100%)		
1) M/s Prime Engineering and Testing Consultants (Pvt.) Ltd. in JV with M/s Associated Consulting Engineers - ACE Ltd. and M/s Concept Engineering Services	593	200	793	24,948,287	Top scoring firm in combined evaluation (PPRA Rule 36(b) (ix))
2) M/s NESPAK (Pvt.) Ltd. in JV with M/s Associated Consultancy Center (Pvt.) Ltd. and M/s Design Management and Development Consultant	580	191	771	26,107,900	2 nd

FINAL EVALUATION REPORT

(As Per Rule 35 of PP Rules, 2004)

Name of Bidder	Marks			Evaluated Cost (EC)* (PKR)	Rule/Regulation/ SBD**/Policy/ Basis for Rejection / Acceptance as per Rule 35 of PP Rules, 2004.
	Technical Score (St) (80%)	Financial Score (Sf) (20 %)	Total Score (100%)		
3) M/s Zeeruk International (Pvt.) Ltd. in JV with M/s APEX Consulting Engineering	Non-Responsive	Financial Proposal not opened			PPRA Rule 36 (b) (viii)
4) M/s CAMEOS Engineering Consultants in JV with M/s Gulf Engineering Consulting Services M/s Gulf Engineering Consulting Services	Non-Responsive	Financial Proposal not opened			PPRA Rule 36 (b) (viii)

*EC is the Evaluated Cost used for evaluation purpose and includes only the cost of competitive component (i.e. Remuneration and Direct Non-Salary Cost) and is exclusive of Provisional Sum, Contingency and Indirect Taxes.

Top Ranked Bidder: M/s Prime Engineering and Testing Consultants (Pvt.) Ltd. in JV with M/s Associated Consulting Engineers - ACE Ltd. and M/s Concept Engineering Services

11. **Any other additional/supporting information, the procuring agency may like to share:** The Procurement was carried out in line with PPRA Rules & Regulations. The bidding was done on QCBS method with 80:20 Technical to Financial Proposals ratio. The Contract is being awarded to M/s Prime Engineering and Testing Consultants (Pvt.) Ltd. in JV with M/s Associated Consulting Engineers - ACE Ltd. and M/s Concept Engineering Services at evaluated financial proposal of Pak. Rs. 33,793,900/-.

Signature:.....

MUHAMMAD AHMED ABRO
DIRECTOR (P&CA)

Official Stamp.....
National Highway Authority.....
Islamabad

****Standard Bidding Documents (SBD).**

National Highway Authority



Annex-I

Criteria

FOR

Final Evaluation

**Consultancy Services for Feasibility Study
and Detailed Design for Construction of
Kharan – Basima Road (125 KM)**

January, 2023

SUMMARY EVALUATION SHEET FOR FULL TECHNICAL PROPOSALS (QCBS)

EVALUATION CRITERIA	Max. Weightage	Firm 1		Firm 2	
		Rating	Score	Rating	Score
1. Firms Experience	100				
General Experience in road Transport Sector	25				
Specific Experience related to particular Assignment	75				
2. Approach and Methodology	250				
2-a. <i>Appreciation of the Project</i>	70				
(i) Evidence of Site Visit with Photographs	(30)				
(ii) Clarity of appreciation	(20)				
(iii) Comprehensiveness of appreciation	(20)				
2-b. <i>Problem Statement/ understanding of objectives</i>	50				
(i) Identification of Problems/ Objectives	(30)				
(ii) Components of Proposed Services	(20)				
2-c. <i>Methodology</i>	80				
(i) Proposed Solutions for this Project	(30)				
(ii) Quality of Methodology	(20)				
(iii) Conciseness, clarity and completeness of proposal*	(30)				
2-d. <i>Suggested Changes for Improvement in TOR</i>	10				
2-e. <i>Work Program</i>	20				
2-f. <i>Staffing Schedule</i>	20				
3. Key Personnel	450				
Firm affidavit for presence of personnel**	25				
(i) Senior Highway Engineer (Team Leader)	120				
(ii) Senior Structural/ Bridge Engineer	70				
(iii) Pavement Engineer & Drainage Engineer	30				
(iv) Transport Economist	25				
(v) Junior Structural/ Bridge Engineer-I & II	2 x 45				
(vi) Junior Highway Engineer-I & II	2 x 45				
4. Performance Certification from clients	75				
Affidavit on stamp paper duly attested by the Oath Commissioner regarding non-blacklisting***	25				
5. Present Commitments (current engagement and available strength – justification)	50				
6. Transfer of Knowledge (Methodology/ Plans)****	50				
TOTAL:	1000				

Excellent - 100% Very Good - 90-99% Above Average – 80-89% Average – 70-79% Below Average – 1-69% Non-complying – 0%

Score: Maximum Weightage x rating / 100. Minimum qualifying score is 70% or 700 marks.

* Conciseness and clarity contains 10 marks and 20 marks will be for the completeness of the proposals which includes but not limited to hard binding, sequential page numbering, signing and stamping of each page of proposal.

** Firm affidavit for presence of personnel carries 25 marks out of 450 marks (complete in all respect as per specimen annexed at Annex-C placed in Technical Proposal Forms).

*** 25 out of 100 marks will be allocated for provision of affidavit on stamp paper duly attested by the Oath Commissioner to the effect that the firm has neither been blacklisted nor any contract rescinded in the past for non-fulfillment of contractual obligations (complete in all respect as per specimen annexed at Annex-B placed in Technical Proposal Forms).

**** 25 out of 50 marks are set for the new firm, the one which has been registered within last six (06) years and which has carried out maximum three (03) projects in last six (06) years and remaining 25 marks are set for methodology/ plans for engaging new firm.



PERSONNEL EVALUATION SHEET

POSITION/AREA OF EXPERTISE	Name	Academic and General Qualification Weightage:30%		Project related Experience Weightage:60%		Status with the Firm 10%		OVERALL RATING (Sum of Weighted Ratings) (A+B+C)
		Percentage Rating	Weighted Rating (A)	Percentage Rating	Weighted Rating (B)	Percentage Rating	Weighted Rating (C)	
(Show all experts to be evaluated)								
(i) Senior Highway Engineer (Team Leader)								
(ii) Senior Structural/ Bridge Engineer								
(iii) Pavement Engineer & Drainage Engineer								
(iv) Transport Economist								
(v) Junior Structural/ Bridge Engineer-I & II								
(vi) Junior Highway Engineer-I & II								

Rating: - Excellent - 100% Very good - 90-99% Above Average - 80-89% Average - 70-79% Below Average - 1-69% Non-complying - 0%

Score: Maximum Weightage X rating / 100.

* For Senior Highway Engineer (Team Leader), Senior Structural/ Bridge Engineer, Pavement Engineer & Drainage Engineer, Junior Structure/ Bridge Engineer, Junior Highway Engineer: M.Sc. - 100%; B.Sc. - 70%.

For Transport Economist & Drainage Engineer: M.Sc. (Transportation Engineering)/ M.Sc. Economics with Diploma/ Degree in Economics/ Transportation Engineering, respectively-100%; B.Sc. (Transportation Engineering) or M.Sc. Economics -70%

** 6 month older employee - 100%;
Less than 6 months or associates- 0%

