

### **KARACHI PORT TRUST**

**GATEWAY TO PAKISTAN** 



### TECHNICAL EVALUATION REPORT (As Per Rule 35 of PP Rules, 2004)

Name of Procuring Agency:

**Karachi Port Trust** 

2. Method of Procurement:

Notice for inviting Tenders through News Papers Published in Daily Business Recorder & Daily 92 News on 09-08-2024, KPT & PPRA Websites on 15-08-2024, under PPRA Rule 36(b) from

Bidders i-e Single Stage Two Envelope.

3. Title of Procurement:

REHABILITATION AND INSTALLATION OF NEW FENDERS NOSING AT BERTH NO. 18, 19, 20 & 21

AT M.I YARD WEST WHARF.

4. Tender Inquiry No.:

E/N-2(162)/

PPRA Ref. No. (TSE):

TS545333E

Date & Time of Bid Closing:

03-10-2024 at 10300 Hrs.

7. Date & Time of Bid Opening:

03-10-2024 at 1100 Hrs.

No of Bids Received:

03 Nos.

9. Criteria for Bid Evaluation:

As per TOR

Details of Bid(s) Evaluation:

Given Below

S. No.	Name of Bidder	Technical Marks (if applicable)	Rule/Regulation/SBD/ Policy/ Basis for Technical Rejection / Acceptance as per Rule 35 of PPRA Rules-2020
1.	M/s. Iqbal & Sons	90.00	Qualified
2.	M/s. Al Madad Construction Co.	86.00	Disqualified
3.	M/s. N Hussain Engineering & EMP Co. Pvt. Ltd.	83.00	Disqualified

11. NIL

Signature:

COTIVE ENGINEER (NORTH) KARACHI PORT TRUST

Official Stamp:

Dy. Chief Engineer-III KARACHI PORT TRUST

### **ATTENDANCE SHEET**

### (TECHNICAL DEPARTMENTAL TENDER COMMITTEE MEETING)

### SUB: REHABILITATION AND INSTALLATION OF NEW FENDERS NOSING AT BERTH NO. 18, 19 20 & 21 M.I. YARD WEST WHARF

Dated: 15-11-2024

S.#	DESIGNATION	SIGN
1.	General Manager (CW)	Mesos
2.	General Manager (O)	1 an
3.	General Manager (E)	n En Vent
4.	General Manager (P&D)	V Kenty
5.	General Manager (F)	marked
6.	Director Port Intelligence	
	Dy. 02 (1) [2] Proc	surd. (4h) whitas
	Dy. CE III)	
	5'le p	) CE - 11
		18/11/24

# S.No. 19 - 33

## MINUTES OF THE MEETING OF THE DEPARTMENTAL TENDER COMMITTEE HELD ON 15-11-2024 IN THE COMMITTEE ROOM OF THE ENGINEERING DEPARTMENT, KPT.

## NAME OF WORK:- REHABILITATION AND INSTALLATION OF NEW FENDERS NOSING AT BERTH NO. 18, 19, 20 & 21 AT M.I YARD WEST WHARF

 After handing over of the East Wharf to AD Ports; presently now West Wharf is playing a major role for Karachi Port Trust, in facilitating the global trade and commerce of our country. In these circumstances, it is essentially required that the port infrastructure especially of West Wharf may be kept in shipshape order.

Hence, a comprehensive survey was made and an estimate for the upkeep of the berths at West Wharf have been prepared wherein, the fenders are the main essential component which needs immediate replacement as they have outlived their useful life.

The salient features of the work are as follows:

I.	Total No. of Berths	09 Nos. 04 Nos. (Berth Nos. 18, 19, 20 & 21)	
II.	Berth for which Fenders are required to be attended		
III.	Nos. of Fenders required to be replaced	22 Nos. $\frac{H = 12}{V = 10}$	

- 2. Due to the reasons stated above and the subsequent to the report of Harbour Master placed at (F/A) alongwith the pictures attached at (F/B), total 22 Nos. of Fenders are needed to be replaced / installed as per the details placed at (F/C).
- 3. Accordingly, the Tenders for the subject work were invited through Press, KPT / PPRA & MoMA Websites on 31-07-2024 in accordance to the Rule 36 (b) of PPRA and were due on 03-09-2024. However, due to some administrative reasons the receipt of the said Bid was extended till 03-10-2024 and the opening was held on the same date.
- 4. In response, the following Three (03) Firms have submitted their sealed Technical / Financial Proposals.

S.No.	Name of Firms
1.	M/s. Iqbal & Sons
2.	M/s. Al Madad Construction Co.
3.	M/s. N Hussain Engineering & EMP Co. Pvt. Ltd.

Technical Proposals for the above 03 firms were opened on same day in the presence of the Committee Members viz:

1.	Reps of General Manager (CW)	Convener
2.	Reps. of General Manager (O)	Member
3.	Reps. of General Manager (E)	Member
4.	Reps. of General Manager (P&D)	Member
5.	Reps. of General Manager (F)	Member
6.	Reps. of Director Port Intelligence	Member

6. After the opening of Technical Proposals, an In-house Committee comprising of the following members was constituted by the Chief Engineer KPT vide letter at S.No.23, to examine the received Technical Bids as per criteria and submit their Technical Evaluation Report as per the practice in vogue.

1.	Engr. Hasan Arif Bilgrami	Chief Engineer	Convener
2.	Engr. Ismail Soomro	Dy. Chief Engineer-I	Member
3.	Engr. Arif Badar Ansari	Dy. Chief Engineer-II	Member

- 7. The Technical Evaluation Criteria of the bidders as mentioned in the Advertisement / Tender Documents is as under:
  - a) Copy of latest Valid NTN, SRB Certificates.
  - b) Copy of Online Tax verification (fresh copy of ATL).
  - c) Valid PEC Registration Certificate
  - d) Company Profile.
  - e) Affidavit, that the firm is non defaulter in Income Tax Department; nor blacklisted by any Organization.
  - f) In case of companies and firms, last three years Audited Financial Statements are to be provided showing minimum average turnover of Rs. 60.0 Million
  - g) In case of individuals / Sole proprietors, last three years tax returns filed with FBR are to be provided showing minimum turnover of Rs. 60.0 Million on average for three years. (As also specified in the Bidding Documents).
  - h) The Bidder have to fulfill Eligibility Criteria as mentioned in the Bidding Document.
  - All submissions are to be duly signed & stamped by the Bidder.

#### 8. FINDINGS OF THE IN-HOUSE COMMITTEE:

Accordingly, after opening of bids an In-house Committee was constituted for the evaluation of the Technical Proposals as submitted by all the three bidders. Subsequently, the Committee scrutinized the proposals in accordance with the Technical Qualification Criteria and produced their observations / remarks on technical qualification based on the requirements set forth in the Bidding Documents vide their detailed report placed at S.No.31.

However, the Committee enquired from all the three Bidders, regarding the documents of the fender brands and specifications to be supplied by them in the light of PIANC guidelines.

Further, all the bidders submitted their respective proposed brand documents as obtained from the third party suppliers and after due verification of these documents the following observations have been gathered by the In- House Committee:

<u>S.</u> <u>NO.</u>	NAME OF BIDDER	PROPOSED VENDOR REGARDING SUPPLY OF FENDERS	REMARKS
1.	M/s. Iqbal & Sons	M/s Jier Marine	The reports and approval as provided have been verified by the Bureau Veritas. Ref. attached as <b>F/D</b> .
2.	M/s. Al Madad Construction Co.	M/s Sunhelm Marine	The reports and approvals as provided could not be verified and Bureau Veritas marked them as fake. Ref attached as <b>F/D</b> .
3.	M/s. N Hussain Engineering & EMP Co. Pvt. Ltd.	M/s Florescence Marine	The reports and approval as provided have been verified by the Bureau Veritas. Ref. attached as <b>F/D</b> .





7. Based on the findings of the Inhouse Committee the status of evaluation is as under:

S. NO	NAME OF QUALIFIED FIRMS	REMARKS
1.	M/s. Iqbal & Sons	<b>DISQUALIFIED</b> as at the time of opening of Tender, the PEC Certificate as provided was not valid; but a renewal slip was attached as a replacement only (which does not vividly manifests the award of renewal of PEC to the Bidder at the time of opening of the Bid).
2.	M/s. Al Madad Construction Co.	DISQUALIFIED due to the reason that, the proposed Fender Documents as submitted by the Bidder after obtaining from the Supplier i.e, M/s Sunhelm Marine were counterfeit and the same was confirmed by Bureau Veritas vide email attached at Annexure-A
3.	M/s. N Hussain Engineering & EMP Co. Pvt. Ltd.	DISQUALIFIED: Could not pass the mandatory sub criteria of relevant experience. Moreover, also the undertaking / affidavit of Non Blacklisting has been found counterfeit, as the Bidder is already blacklisted on the PPRA Website as attached at Annexure-B.

After due diligence, the Committee submitted its detailed report (placed at S.No. 31) for reference. As per the Technical Evaluation Report of In-house Committee, all the Three Bidders have been found disqualified in accordance with the given criteria:

S. NO.	NAME OF QUALIFIED FIRMS	REMARKS
1.	M/s. Iqbal & Sons	Disqualified
2.	M/s. Al Madad Construction Co.	Disqualified
3.	M/s. N Hussain Engineering & EMP Co. Pvt. Ltd.	Disqualified

on detailed technical

ENGR. ARIF BADAR ANSARI DY. CHIEF ENGINEER-II

(MEMBER)

ENGR. ISMAIL SOOMRO DY. CHIEF ENGINEER-I

(MEMBER)

ENGR. HASAN ARIE <del>BILGR</del> CHIEF ENGINEER

CONVENER)

#### RECOMMENDATIONS OF THE DEPARTMENTAL TENDER COMMITTEE:

- The In-house Technical Evaluation Committee has carried out the Evaluation of the Bids and has
  recommended that, all three firms are Disqualified on mentioned technical grounds as stated in their
  afore mentioned Report.
- 10. Accordingly, the Technical Evaluation Report was placed before the DTC members on 15-11-2024, and upon detailed deliberation among GMs' it was unanimously recommended that:
  - a. The Technical Bid of M/s. Iqbal & Sons should be considered as only Qualified Bid after getting online verification of the license of the Firm which stands Valid upto 30<sup>th</sup> June 2027. Moreover, the financial bid of the said firm shall be opened and if the quoted amount of the same comes out to be above the corresponding Engineer's Estimate their bid shall not be considered and the tenders may be discharged.
  - b. The financial bids of the other two bidders shall be returned unopened.
  - c. M/s Al Madad & Co. should be debarred from participation in tendering process pertaining to Rubber Fender works for Fiscal year 2024-2025.

Hence, in the light of DTC Committee's Report, the Chairman KPT's approval is therefore solicited for the opening of the Financial Bid of the qualified Firm M/s. Iqbal & Sons for carrying out the project viz. "REHABILITATION AND INSTALLATION OF NEW FENDERS & NOSING AT BERTH NO. 18, 19, 20 & 21 AT M.I YARD WEST WHARF".

GENERAL MANAGER (O) (MEMBER)

GENERAL MANAGER (F) (MEMBER) GENERAL MANAGER (E) (MEMBER) GENERAL MANAGER (P&D) (MEMBER)

DIRECTOR PORT INTELLEGENCE (MEMBER)

GENERAL MANAGER (CW)

(CONVENOR)

Page 4 of 4

### **Public Tenders**

View By: <u>All\_Organizations\_Sectors</u>
Please Click on image ♣ to Download/View.

Only 10 days old tenders from the closing date will be shown.

Organization Name: Karachi Port Trust

Sector Name: Services Civil Works Miscellaneous Repair/Maintenance

Tender No	Tender Title	Download	Advertised Date	Closing Date
TOSASOON	Karachi Port Trust, Karachi Rehabilitation and Installation of New			
TS545333E Online Invoice	Fenders Nosing At Ber Rehabilitation and Installation of New Fenders Nosing At Ber	Cozzigendum	30/8/2024	3/10/2024 10:30:00 AM
TS545808E Online Invoice	N/A Karachi Port Trust, Karachi Removal / Replacement of Rusted Perforated Component Plate o Removal / Replacement of Rusted Perforated Component Plate o N/A	≛ Comigendum	30/8/2024	12/9/2024 10:30:00 AM
TS546684E Online Invoice	Karachi Port Trust, Karachi PROCUREMENT OF VARIOUS ITEMS AS PER TENDER ATTACHED PROCUREMENT OF VARIOUS ITEMS AS PER TENDER ATTACHED 2425-647, 655 TO 657, 682, 683, 759, 760, 804, 809, 842, 849	<b>.</b>	30/8/2024	17/9/2024 10:30:00 AM
TS546575E Online Invoice	Karachi Port Trust, Karachi MAINTENANCE AND REPAIR TO WASHROOM AND KITCHEN AT PSF BARRAC MAINTENANCE AND REPAIR TO WASHROOM AND KITCHEN AT PSF BARRAC	÷	29/8/2024	18/9/2024 10:30:00 AM
TS546446E Online Invoice	No: E/CS-2(12)/2024 Karachi Port Trust, Karachi PAINT/COLORING AT CHAIRMAN LOBBY AND STAIRCASE OF LIFT AREA PAINT/COLORING AT CHAIRMAN LOBBY AND STAIRCASE OF LIFT AREA No: E/N-2(206)/	<b>.</b>	28/8/2024	18/9/2024 11:00:00 AM
Online Invoice	Karachi Port Trust, Karachi MAINTENANCE REPAIR AND REPLACEMENT OF WORN OUT FRESH WATER ( MAINTENANCE REPAIR AND REPLACEMENT OF WORN OUT FRESH	<b>.</b>	27/8/2024	13/9/2024 10:30:00 AM