



# NATIONAL HIGHWAY AUTHORITY

Procurement & Contract Administration Section

28-Mauve Area, G-9/1, Islamabad Tel: 9032727, Fax: 9260419

No. 6(615)/GM/(P&CA)/NHA/2024/439

Islamabad, 29 October, 2024

**DIRECTOR GENERAL**

PUBLIC PROCUREMENT REGULATORY AUTHORITY  
1<sup>ST</sup> FLOOR FBC BUILDING NEAR STATE BANK,  
SECTOR G-5/2, ISLAMABAD.

**SUBJECT: ANNOUNCEMENT OF FINAL EVALUATION REPORT (PPRA RULE-35):  
CONSULTANCY SERVICES AS ASSISTANT TO EMPLOYER'S  
REPRESENTATIVE (AER) FOR CONSTRUCTION OF TWO TUNNELS AT  
KAHORI/ KAMSER (3.7 KM APPROX.) AND CHALLPANI (0.6 KM APPROX.)  
SECTION OF NEELUM VALLEY ROAD, AZAD JAMMU & KASHMIR (AJ&K)  
ON EPC/ TURNKEY MODE**

Reference: PPRA Rule-35

Find enclosed herewith the Final Evaluation Report along with Evaluation Criteria (Annex-I) for the subject Services in line with PPRA Rule-35 for uploading on PPRA website at the earliest, please.



(FAYYAZ AHMED)

General Manager (P&CA)

**DISTRIBUTION:**

**ENCL:** Evaluation Report along with **Annex- I**

**COPY TO:**

- Member (Planning), NHA, Islamabad;
- Dy. Director (P&CA), NHA, Islamabad.

# FINAL EVALUATION REPORT

(As Per Rule 35 of PP Rules, 2004)

1.	Name of Procuring Agency:	National Highway Authority
2.	Method of Procurement:	Single Stage Two Envelope Procedure
3.	Title of Procurement:	Consultancy Services as Assistant to Employer's Representative (AER) for Construction of Two Tunnels at Kahori/ Kamser (3.7 Km Approx.) and Challpani (0.6 Km Approx.) Section of Neelum Valley Road, Azad Jammu & Kashmir (AJ&K) on EPC/ Turnkey Mode
4.	Tender Inquiry No.:	6(615)
5.	PPRA Ref. No. (TSE):	TS524088E
6.	Date & Time of Bid Closing:	4 <sup>th</sup> January, 2024 at 1130 hours local time
7.	Date & Time of Bid Opening:	4 <sup>th</sup> January, 2024 at 1200 hours local time
8.	No of Bids Received:	Four (04) Proposals were received
9.	Criteria for Bid Evaluation:	Criteria of Bid Evaluation is attached at Annex-I
10.	Details of Bid(s) Evaluation:	As below

Name of Bidder	Marks			Evaluated Cost (EC)* (PKR)	Rule/Regulation / SBD**/Policy/ Basis for Rejection / Acceptance as per Rule 35 of PP Rules, 2004.
	Technical Score (St) (80%)	Financial Score (Sf) (20 %)	Total Score (100%)		
1) M/s Engineering & Management Service in JV with M/s Associated Consulting Engineers (ACE) Ltd., M/s Prime Engineering & Testing Consultants (Pvt.) Ltd. and in association with M/s Z-Tech Engineering Solutions (Sub-Consultants)	625	187	812	355,930,066	Top scoring firm in combined evaluation (PPRA Rule 36(b) (ix))
2) M/s NESPAK (Pvt.) Ltd. in association with M/s Hadi Engineering Consultants (Sub-Consultant)	586	200	786	333,467,277	2 <sup>nd</sup>
3) M/s Finite Engineering (Pvt.) Ltd. in JV with M/s Arcadian Consultancy service and in association with M/s Karakoram Engineers (Sub-Consultant)	457	Technically Dis-Qualified (Less than 70 %) Financial Proposal not Opened			PPRA Rule 36 (b) (v)

# FINAL EVALUATION REPORT

(As Per Rule 35 of PP Rules, 2004)

Name of Bidder	Marks			Evaluated Cost (EC)* (PKR)	Rule/Regulation / SBD**/Policy/ Basis for Rejection / Acceptance as per Rule 35 of PP Rules, 2004.
	Technical Score (St) (80%)	Financial Score (Sf) (20 %)	Total Score (100%)		
4) M/s BK Consultants (Pvt.) Ltd. in JV with M/s Associated Consultancy Centre (Pvt.) Ltd., M/s Asif Ali & Associates (Pvt.) Ltd., M/s A.A Associates and in association with M/s Tareek Consulting Engineer (SMC-Pvt.) Ltd. (Sub-Consultant)	Not Evaluated	Non-Responsive As per Clause 20.1 (i) of Data Sheet of RFP			PPRA Rule 36 (b) (v)

\*EC is the Evaluated Cost used for evaluation purpose and includes only the cost of competitive component (i.e. Remuneration and Direct Non-Salary Cost) and is exclusive of Provisional Sum, Contingency and Indirect Taxes.

**Most Advantageous Consultant:** M/s Engineering & Management Service in JV with M/s Associated Consulting Engineers (ACE) Ltd., M/s Prime Engineering & Testing Consultants (Pvt.) Ltd. and in association with M/s Z-Tech Engineering Solutions (Sub-Consultants)

11. **Any other additional/supporting information, the procuring agency may like to share:** The Procurement was carried out in line with PPRA Rules & Regulations. The bidding was done on QCBS method with 80:20 Technical to Financial Proposals ratio. The Contract will be awarded to M/s Engineering & Management Service in JV with M/s Associated Consulting Engineers (ACE) Ltd., M/s Prime Engineering & Testing Consultants (Pvt.) Ltd. and in association with M/s Z-Tech Engineering Solutions (Sub-Consultants) at evaluated Consultancy Cost of Pak. Rs. 413,283,177/- which includes Salary Cost, Direct Non-Salary Cost and all applicable taxes including GST.

Signature:.....

General Manager (P&CA)  
National Highway Authority  
Islamabad

Official Stamp:.....

**\*\*Standard Bidding Documents (SBD).**

# National Highway Authority



**Annex-I**

**Criteria**

*FOR*

**Final Evaluation**

**Consultancy Services as  
Assistant to Employer's Representative  
(AER) for Construction of Two Tunnels at  
Kahori/ Kamser (3.7 Km Approx.) and  
Challpani (0.6 Km Approx.) Section of  
Neelum Valley Road, Azad Jammu &  
Kashmir (AJ&K) on EPC/ Turnkey Mode**

**October, 2024**

## SUMMARY EVALUATION SHEET FOR FULL TECHNICAL PROPOSALS (FTP)

EVALUATION CRITERIA	Max. Weightage	Firm 1		Firm 2	
		Rating	Score	Rating	Score
<b>1. Firms Experience</b>	<b>100</b>				
1-a. General Experience in road Transport Sector	25				
1-b. Specific Experience related to particular Assignment	75				
<b>2. Approach and Methodology</b>	<b>250</b>				
2-a. Appreciation of the Project	70				
(i) Evidence of Site Visit with Photographs giving a clear understanding/ proof of the project site	(30)				
(ii) Clarity of appreciation	(20)				
(iii) Comprehensiveness of appreciation	(20)				
2-b. Problem Statement/ understanding of objectives	50				
(i) Identification of Problems/ Objectives	(30)				
(ii) Components of Proposed Services	(20)				
2-c. Methodology	80				
(i) Proposed Solutions for this Project	(30)				
(ii) Quality of Methodology	(20)				
(iii) Conciseness, clarity and completeness of proposal	(30)				
2-d. Suggested Changes for Improvement in TOR	10				
2-e. Work Program	20				
2-f. Staffing Schedule	20				
<b>3. Key Personnel</b>	<b>450</b>				
Firm affidavit for presence of personnel	25				
<b>a- Phase I (a), (b) &amp; Phase II (a) (Key-Staff)</b>					
i. Team Leader (Engineer)	20				
ii. Procurement Specialist	20				
<b>b- Phase II (b) &amp; Phase III (Key-Staff)</b>					
i. Resident Engineer	65				
ii. Tunnel Engineer	50				
iii. Junior Tunnel Engineer	25				
iv. Geotechnical Engineer (Intermittent Basis)	50				
v. Material Engineer	50				
vi. Pavement Specialist	50				
vii. Contract Specialist	40				
viii. Environmental Specialist (Intermittent Basis)	25				
ix. Quantity Surveyor	30				
<b>4. Performance Certification from clients</b>	<b>75</b>				
Affidavit on stamp paper duly attested by the Oath Commissioner regarding non-blacklisting	25				
<b>5. Present Commitments (current engagement and available strength – justification)</b>	<b>50</b>				
<b>6. Transfer of Knowledge (Methodology/ Plans)</b>	<b>50</b>				
<b>TOTAL:</b>	<b>1000</b>				

Excellent - 100% Very Good - 90-99% Above Average – 80-89% Average – 70-79% Below Average – 1-69% Non-complying – 0%  
 Score: Maximum Weightage x rating / 100. Minimum qualifying score is 70% or 700 marks.

