



NATIONAL HIGHWAY AUTHORITY

Procurement & Contract Administration Section
28-Mauve Area, G-9/1, Islamabad Tel: 9032727, Fax: 9260419

No. 6(585)/GM (P&CA)/NHA/2023/33

Islamabad, ./.January, 2023

Director General

Public Procurement Regulatory Authority
1st Floor FBC Building near State Bank,
Sector G-5/2,
Islamabad

Subject: **ANNOUNCEMENT OF EVALUATION REPORT (PPRA RULE-35):
CONSULTANCY SERVICES FOR DESIGN REVIEW AND
CONSTRUCTION SUPERVISION OF REHABILITATION AND
IMPROVEMENT OF NATIONAL HIGHWAY N-5 SECTION**

Reference: *PPRA Rule-35*

Find enclosed herewith the Combined Bid Evaluation Report along with Evaluation Criteria (Annex-I) for the subject Services in line with PPRA Rule-35 for uploading on PPRA website at the earliest, please.

(Sami-Ur-Rahman)
General Manager (P&CA)

Encl: Evaluation Report along with **Annex- I**

Copy for kind information to:

- Member (Planning), NHA, Islamabad;
- Director (Tech. to Chairman), NHA, Islamabad;
- Director (Services)-P&CA, NHA, Islamabad.

FINAL EVALUATION REPORT

(As Per Rule 35 of PP Rules, 2004)

1.	Name of Procuring Agency:	National Highway Authority
2.	Method of Procurement:	Single Stage Two Envelope Procedure
3.	Title of Procurement:	Consultancy Services for Design Review and Construction Supervision of Rehabilitation and Improvement of National Highway N-5 Section
4.	Tender Inquiry No.:	6(585)
5.	PPRA Ref. No. (TSE):	TS488408E
6.	Date & Time of Bid Closing:	12 th September, 2022 at 1130 hours local time
7.	Date & Time of Bid Opening:	12 th September, 2022 at 1200 hours local time
8.	No of Bids Received:	Ten (10) Proposals were received
9.	Criteria for Bid Evaluation:	Criteria of Bid Evaluation is attached at Annex-I
10.	Details of Bid(s) Evaluation:	As below

Name of Bidder	Marks			PHASE-I	PHASE-II	Evaluated Cost (EC)* (PKR)	Rule/Regulation/ SBD**/Policy/ Basis for Rejection / Acceptance as per Rule 35 of PP Rules, 2004.
	Technical (if applicable)	Financial (if applicable)	Total (out of 1000)	PKR	USD/RMB		
1- M/s PEAS Consulting (Pvt.) Ltd in JV with M/s Finite Engineering (Pvt.) Ltd., M/s Exponent Engineers and in association with M/s Actrow Consultant (Sub-Consultant)	581	200	781	3,351,745	\$352,647	78,811,150	Top scoring firm in combined evaluation (PPRA Rule 36(b) (ix))

FINAL EVALUATION REPORT

(As Per Rule 35 of PP Rules, 2004)

Name of Bidder	Marks			PHASE-I	PHASE-II	Evaluated Cost (EC)* (PKR)	Rule/Regulation/SBD**/Policy/ Basis for Rejection / Acceptance as per Rule 35 of PP Rules, 2004.
	Technical (if applicable)	Financial (if applicable)	Total (out of 1000)	PKR	USD/RMB		
2-M/s Associated Consulting Engineers-ACE Ltd. in JV with M/s Associated Consultancy Centre (Pvt.) Ltd., M/s Zeeruk International (Pvt.) Ltd. and in association with M/s Effective Engineering Expertise (Pvt.) Ltd.	652	108	760	6,662,157	\$ 651,471	146,063,922	2 nd
3-M/s Engineering General Consultants-EGC (Pvt.) Ltd in JV with M/s Indus Associated Consultants and in association with M/s Power Aim Engineering Services (Pvt.) Ltd.	576	133	709	3,790,500	¥3,635,670	118,750,385	3 rd
4- M/s A.A Associates in JV with M/s Asif Ali & Associates (Pvt.) Ltd. and in association with M/s Concept Planning and Engineering Services	569	99	668	10,581,295	\$695,906	159,491,244	4 th
5- M/s Techno-Consult International (Pvt.) Ltd. in JV with M/s Loya Associates and in association with M/s Tech-Professionals and Consultants (Pvt.) Ltd.	592	74	666	12,482,500	\$ 943,392	214,349,588	5 th

FINAL EVALUATION REPORT

(As Per Rule 35 of PP Rules, 2004)

Name of Bidder	Marks			PHASE-I	PHASE-II	Evaluated Cost (EC)* (PKR)	Rule/Regulation/SBD**/Policy/ Basis for Rejection / Acceptance as per Rule 35 of PP Rules, 2004.
	Technical (if applicable)	Financial (if applicable)	Total (out of 1000)	PKR	USD/RMB		
6-M/s NESPAK (Pvt.) Ltd. in association with M/s AI Engineers Pakistan (Pvt.) Ltd.	578	66	644	7,028,039	\$1,084,029	238,988,564	6 th
7- M/s PAVRON in JV with M/s Osmani & Company (Pvt.) Ltd., M/s BK Consultant (SMC-Pvt.) Ltd. and in association with M/s Pakistan Engineering Tech	541	Financial Proposals not opened					Dis-Qualified (Less than 70%) PPRA Rule 36 (b) (v)
8-M/s Republic Engineering Corporation (Pvt.) Ltd in JV with M/s ABM Engineers., M/s ESS-I-AAR Planning, Engineering & services Consultants and in association with M/s origin Consulting Engineers	527	Financial Proposals not opened					Dis-Qualified (Less than 70%) PPRA Rule 36 (b) (v)
9- M/s Umar Munshi Associates in JV with M/s Cameos Engineering Consultant, M/s Electra Consultants and in association with M/s National infrastructure Engineering Services (NIES)	488	Financial Proposals not opened					Dis-Qualified (Less than 70%) PPRA Rule 36 (b) (v)
10- M/s Partners in Development - PID in JV with M/s Creative Engineering Consultants (CEC), M/s Global Consultants and M/s Spectra Engineering Solutions	387	Financial Proposals not opened					Dis-Qualified (Less than 70%) PPRA Rule 36 (b) (v)

FINAL EVALUATION REPORT

(As Per Rule 35 of PP Rules, 2004)

* a) EC is the Evaluated Cost used for evaluation purpose and includes only the cost of competitive component (i.e. Remuneration and Direct Non-Salary Cost) and is exclusive of Provisional Sum, Contingency and Indirect Taxes.


b) Submission date: 12th September, 2022

28 days prior submission: 15th August, 2022

Exchange Rate to PKR: RMB 31.62 & USD 213.93.

Top Ranked Bidder: M/s PEAS Consulting (Pvt.) Ltd in JV with M/s Finite Engineering (Pvt.) Ltd., M/s Exponent Engineers and in association with M/s Actrow Consultant (Sub-Consultant)

11. **Any other additional/supporting information, the procuring agency may like to share:** The Procurement was carried out in line with PPRA Rules & Regulations. The bidding was done on QCBS method with 80:20 Technical to Financial Proposals ratio. The Contract is being awarded to M/s PEAS Consulting (Pvt.) Ltd in JV with M/s Finite Engineering (Pvt.) Ltd., M/s Exponent Engineers and in association with M/s Actrow Consultant (Sub-Consultant) at agreed cost of Pak. Rs.9,437,472/- (Phase-I which is GOP funded) and USD 422,250 (Phase-II which is China grant funded) which includes all types of Federal, Provincial and Local taxes including GST@13%.

Signature:.....

General Manager (P&CA)
National Highway Authority

Official Stamp:..... Islamabad

****Standard Bidding Documents (SBD).**

National Highway Authority



Annex-I

Criteria

FOR

Bid Evaluation

**CONSULTANCY SERVICES FOR DESIGN REVIEW AND
CONSTRUCTION SUPERVISION OF REHABILITATION AND
IMPROVEMENT OF NATIONAL HIGHWAY N-5 SECTION**

January, 2023

JM

SUMMARY EVALUATION SHEET FOR FULL TECHNICAL PROPOSALS (QCBS)

EVALUATION CRITERIA	Max. Weightage	Firm 1		Firm 2	
		Rating	Score	Rating	Score
1. Firms Experience	100				
1-a. General Experience in road Transport Sector	25				
1-b. Specific Experience related to particular Assignment	75				
2. Approach and Methodology	250				
2-a. <i>Appreciation of the Project</i>	70				
(i) Evidence of Site Visit with Photographs giving a clear understanding/ proof of the project site	(30)				
(ii) Clarity of appreciation	(20)				
(iii) Comprehensiveness of appreciation	(20)				
2-b. Problem Statement/ understanding of objectives	50				
(i) Identification of Problems/ Objectives	(30)				
(ii) Components of Proposed Services	(20)				
2-c. Methodology	80				
(i) Proposed Solutions for this Project	(30)				
(ii) Quality of Methodology	(20)				
(iii) Conciseness, clarity and completeness of proposal	(30)				
2-d. Suggested Changes for Improvement in TOR	10				
2-e. Work Program	20				
2-f. Staffing Schedule	20				
3. Key Personnel	450				
Firm affidavit for presence of personnel	25				
Review of Detailed Design (Phase-I):	20				
a) Team Leader	10				
b) Highway Design /Pavement Engineer	10				
c) Structure / Bridge Engineer	10				
d) Highway Safety Engineer	10				
e) Soil/Geotechnical Engineer	10				
Construction Supervision Team (Phase-II):	80				
a) Team Leader	70				
b) Resident Engineer	2 x 50				
c) Assistant Resident Engineer (Highways)-I,II	25				
d) Contract Specialist	20				
e) Environmental Engineer	4x10				
f) Site Inspector-I,II,III,IV	20				
g) Material Engineer	10				
h) Quantity Surveyor	10				
4. Performance Certification from Employers	25				
Affidavit on stamp paper duly attested by the Oath Commissioner regarding non-blacklisting	50				
5. Present Commitments (current engagement and available strength – justification)	50				
6. Transfer of Knowledge (Methodology/ Plans)	50				
TOTAL:	1000				

Excellent - 100% Very Good - 90-99% Above Average - 80-89% Average - 70-79% Below Average - 1-69% Non-complying - 0%
 Score: Maximum Weightage x rating / 100. Minimum qualifying score is 70% or 700 marks.



PERSONNEL EVALUATION SHEET

POSITION / AREA OF EXPERTISE	Name	Academic and General Qualification* Weightage 30%		Project related Experience Weightage 60% for Design Review and 65% for Construction Supervision		Status with the Firm** 10% for Design Review and 05% for Construction Supervision		OVERALL RATING (Sum of Weighted Ratings) (A+B+C)
		Percentage Rating	Weighted Rating (A)	Percentage Rating	Weighted Rating (B)	Percentage Rating	Weighted Rating (C)	
(Show all experts to be evaluated)								
Review of Detailed Design (Phase-I):								
a) Team Leader								
b) Highway Design /Pavement Engineer								
c) Structure / Bridge Engineer								
d) Highway Safety Engineer								
e) Soil/Geotechnical Engineer								
Construction Supervision Team (Phase-II):								
a) Team Leader								
b) Resident Engineer								
c) Assistant Resident Engineer (Highways)-I,II								
d) Contract Specialist								
e) Environmental Engineer								
f) Site Inspector-I,II,III,IV								
g) Material Engineer								
h) Quantity Surveyor								

Rating: - Excellent - 100% Very good – 90-99% Above Average – 80-89% Average – 70-79% Below Average – 1-69% Non-complying - 0%

Score: Maximum Weightage X rating / 100.

* For Qualification and Experience of above Key Personnel, refer to Appendix-BII of TOR.

** 6 month's older employee - 100%; Less than 6 months or associates- 0% (For more than six months, salary account certificate duly attested from employer shall be attached with the proposal.)

For Team Leader, Highway Design/Pavement Engineer, Structure/Bridge Engineer, Highway Safety Engineer, Soil/Geotechnical Engineer, PhD.-100%; M.Sc with addition: relevant Training from recognized institution-100 % M.Sc-90% B.Sc with additional relevant training from a recognized institutions- 80% B.Sc. – 70%.

For, Resident Engineer, Assistant Resident Engineer (Highways), Contract Specialist, Environment Engineer, Material Engineer M.Sc-100% B.Sc with additional relevant Training from recognized organizations- 90% B.Sc. – 70%.

For Site inspector M.Sc-100% B.Sc- 70%

For Quantity Surveyor B.Sc-100% DAE (Civil)-70%

